

KIRKLEES METROPOLITAN COUNCIL INVESTMENT & REGENERATION SERVICE

DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended) – SECTION 16

DELEGATED DECISION TO DETERMINE APPLICATIONS FOR LISTED BUILDING CONSENT

Reference No: 2020/65/93387/E

Site Address: Low House, Quaker Bottom, Penistone Road, High Flatts, Huddersfield, HD8 8XU

Description: Listed Building Consent for replacement windows, rooms in roof space, internal and external alterations and repairs (within a Conservation Area)

Recommending Officer: Craig McHugh

DECISION – Grant Listed Building Consent

I hereby authorise the approval of this application for the reasons set out in the officer's report and recommendation annexed below in respect of the above matter.

Nick Grimshaw

AUTHORISED OFFICER

Date: 08-Jan-2021

Officer Report

Site Description

The hamlet of Quaker Bottom is at the end of a lane off the A629 Huddersfield – Penistone road, between Ingbirchworth and Bird's Edge, two miles south-west of Denby Dale. The hamlet consists of half a dozen buildings, including houses, former farm buildings, stabling and a Quaker Meeting House with associated burial ground which have their origins in the 17th century. The setted roadway leads to an open yard surrounded by the various sandstone buildings. Low House is on the south-east side, facing south-east over an extensive terraced walled garden. Stone walling extends either side of the south elevation to enclose the garden.

Low House is two storeys and constructed from locally quarried sandstone laid in thin, slightly irregular courses, with ashlar quoins on each corner. Window and door surrounds are mostly smoothly-dressed sandstone. The roof is formed of stone flags, with copings supported by kneelers. There are two chimney stacks – one with 3 flues on the west gable; and one between the east end rooms and the centre of the building, with 6 flues. The dormer on the south side is a 20th century insertion. The window and door openings and joinery reveal several phases of alterations from the 17th century to the 20th.

Internally there are features of architectural and historical interest including the staircase (stone with iron balusters), internal joinery and some fireplaces. There is a large attic space, partly converted. The roof trusses are all the same pattern, each with a king-post jointed and pegged into a collar between the principal rafters. The collars themselves are also supported by queen posts. There are angled struts between the enlarged foot of each post and the principal rafter. This style of roof is usually found from the mid-18th century into the 19th. There are 4 sets of purlins on each side.

Description of Proposal

Listed Building Consent for replacement windows, rooms in roof space, internal and external alterations and repairs (within a Conservation Area).

The works comprise the following:

External repairs

- re-roofing
- re-pointing
- localised stone repairs and replacements

External alterations

- partial replacement of windows with new timber windows with slim-section double glazed units
- installation of conservation rooflights and a new lighting scheme throughout the property

Internal alterations

- alterations to the internal layout to re-plan the entrance, utility room and ground floor WC, re-planning and replacement of the kitchen, storeroom,
- replacement of the fireplace to the lounge
- replacement of the fires to the master bedroom, re-instatement of original surround and new fire to bedroom 3
- alterations to the layout of master bedroom ensuite and walk-in-wardrobe
- new staircase to attic floor
- installation of a shower room to attic floor
- conversion of remaining areas of the attic

History of negotiations/amendments received

Amendments to the design of the windows were required to refine the joinery details and window types. Clarification was sought on aspects of the structural repairs to the attic and roof and the significance of the door and doorway to be removed from store area on the ground floor.

Relevant Planning History

Plan_Ref	Proposal	Decision
94/93847	LISTED BUILDING CONSENT FOR REMOVAL OF STEPS AND DEMOLITION OF BOUNDARY WALL	CONSENT REFUSED APPEAL DISMISSED
94/93846	FORMATION OF VEHICULAR ACCESS AND OUTLINE APPLICATION FOR ERECTION OF DETACHED DOUBLE GARAGE (WITHIN CURTILAGE OF LISTED BUILDING)	REFUSED APPEAL DISMISSED
99/91473	LISTED BUILDING CONSENT FOR FORMATION OF ACCESS AND LAYING OUT OF PARKING AREA (WITHIN A CONSERVATION AREA)	WITHDRAWN
99/91472	FORMATION OF ACCESS AND CAR PARKING AREA TO DWELLING (WITHIN THE CURTILAGE OF A LISTED BUILDING AND CONSERVATION AREA)	REFUSED
2006/91541	LISTED BUILDING CONSENT FOR INTERNAL ALTERATIONS (WITHIN A CONSERVATION AREA)	CONSENT GRANTED

Consultation Responses

Officer report has been compiled by the Conservation and Design Officer.

Denby Dale Parish Council – No objections subject to conservation area regulations

Public/Members Response

The application has been publicised with a site notice and a press notice.

No representations have been received.

Date site notice expired: 27/11/2020

Publicity expiry date: 20/11/2020

Policy

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that planning applications are determined in accordance with the Development Plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. The statutory Development Plan for Kirklees is the Local Plan (adopted 27th February 2019).

Local Plan

- LP35 Historic environment

National Policies and Guidance:

National planning policy and guidance is set out in National Policy Statements, primarily the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) published February 2019, together with Circulars, Parliamentary Statements and associated technical guidance.

The NPPF constitutes guidance for local planning authorities and is a material consideration in determining applications.

- Chapter 16 (Conserving and Enhancing the Historic Environment)

Access considerations

None

Climate Change Emergency

On 12th November 2019, the Council adopted a target for achieving 'net zero' carbon emissions by 2038, with an accompanying carbon budget set by the Tyndall Centre for Climate Change Research. National Planning Policy includes a requirement to promote carbon reduction and enhance resilience to climate change through the planning system and these principles have been incorporated into the formulation of Local Plan policies. The Local Plan pre-dates the declaration of a climate emergency and the net zero carbon target, however it includes a series of policies which are used to assess the suitability of planning applications in the context of climate change. When determining planning applications the Council will use the relevant Local Plan policies and guidance documents to embed the climate change agenda.

The existing windows are all single glazed, the replacements will be double glazed and therefore improve the thermal performance of the building and reduce carbon emissions from the building over their life time.

Assessment

Significance of the affected heritage assets

Paragraph 189 of the NPPF requires that applicants describe the significance of any heritage assets affected, including any contribution made by their setting, consult the historic environment record, use appropriate expertise where necessary and where there is known or potential archaeological interest, submit an appropriate desk-based assessment and, where necessary, a field evaluation.

The applicant has provided a heritage statement and a historic building record, which fulfils the requirements of paragraph 189.

Paragraph 190 of the NPPF requires that the Local Planning Authority identify and assess the particular significance of any heritage assets affected and take this into account when considering the impact of the proposal on a heritage asset.

The proposed works affect the grade II listed Low House, 3 Quaker Bottom. Low House is a good example of a vernacular dwelling dating from the early to mid-18th century, which has undergone several phases of alterations which can be read in its fabric. It illustrates the working arrangements of the textile industry in the 18th century with provision for workshop space and storage with separate access. It makes a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the High Flatts Conservation Area.

Impact of the proposed alterations

Section 66(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires that the Local Planning Authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

LP 35 of the Local Plan requires that proposals affecting a designated heritage asset should preserve or enhance the significance of the asset.

Paragraph 193 of the NPPF requires that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

Paragraph 190 of the NPPF requires that the Local Planning Authority avoid or minimise any conflict between the heritage asset's conservation and any aspect of the proposal.

Repair works

The proposed works include external repairs as follows:

- re-roofing
- re-pointing
- localised stone repairs and replacements

Re-roofing is proposed on a like for like basis with a new breathable roofing membrane below. Leadwork to the dormer window will be replaced in accordance with the Lead Sheetwork Association Details. Stone copings will be reset with positive anchorage where necessary. There is localised evidence of insect damage to the roof timbers, these will be treated. There is some evidence of dipping of the purlins to the south roof slope at the east end of the building, which may require alterations. It is recommended that stone roofing slates to match the existing and details of any structural interventions to repair or replace the purlins be conditioned to minimise any harm.

Repointing with lime mortar is proposed to the chimneys and all elevations, this will benefit the long-term conservation of the masonry. It is recommended that a sample is conditioned.

Localised stone repairs and replacements are needed, it is proposed to use replacement stone where whole units have failed and to use repair techniques including epoxy repair mortars and new sections of stone fixed with stainless steel dowels.

The repair works will have a moderate positive impact. It is recommended that a replacement stone is conditioned to match the existing.

External alterations

The proposed works include the following external alterations:

- partial replacement of windows with new timber windows with slim double-glazed units
- installation of conservation rooflights

The listed building has various different types of window openings relating to the different phases of its development, these in turn have various different window designs evidencing different phases of repair, alteration and replacement, some of which contribute to the historic and architectural interest of the building, some of which do not. They are in varying states of repair. The proposed works seek to rationalise these to a degree, whilst still retaining evidence of the complex history of the building.

The earliest are chamfered mullioned window openings, typically dating from the 17th century. These may have been relocated from elsewhere. These are found only on the east gable elevation to the first floor and attic. Only the existing timber windows to the first floor are to be replaced, these appear to date from the later 19th century and retain no historic glass. It is proposed to replace these with new timber windows with profiles to match the existing and incorporating slim double-glazed units (proposed types 3a and 3b).

The listed building's 18th century window surrounds have square-cut rectangular pieces of stone fitted flush with the face of the building, those to the front are single light, those to the rear have mullions and two, three or four lights. The windows to be replaced comprise a mix of late 19th century 1over1 and 2over2 sash windows to the front and east gable elevations with very limited historic glazing remaining and modern replacement windows casement to the rear of no interest. They are to be replaced with sliding sash windows with profiles to match the existing and incorporating slim-section double-glazed units to the front and east gable elevation (proposed type 2). To the rear fixed lights and top hung casements will be used to match the design proposed for the bay windows discussed below (proposed types 1 and 1a). Sash windows cannot be accommodated in these surrounds due to their original design or later alterations.

The south elevation has two prominent full-height bay windows serving the rooms at either end of the house dating from the late 19th century. These have good quality ashlar stonework. Each window has a single tall mullion with four-panes separated by unusually thin glazing bars. The side windows only have two panes; on the east side these have been altered by making the upper one into a top hung casement opening. One sixth of the glazing to these windows is historic glass but at some point all the windows have had external timber beading applied. They are to be replaced with windows with profiles to match the existing and incorporating slim double-glazed units, with the exception of the external beading which is to be in putty (proposed types 1 and 1a). The bay windows present a risk of falling from height due to the very low cill height, safety glazing is to be used.

The proposed replacement windows will cause moderate harm to the significance of the listed building due to the loss of some late 19th century windows, some of which incorporate a small proportion of historic glass. Most of the windows have already been altered in some way since the 19th century to incorporate new openers or replace putty beading with timber beading. The design of the proposed new windows closely replicates the original appearance thereby minimising any harm caused.

Four new conservation rooflights are proposed to provide light to the large attic spaces. The size and design of the rooflights sufficiently reduces the harm caused to a minimal level.

Internal alterations

The proposed works include the following internal alterations:

- alterations to the internal layout of the ground floor to re-plan the entrance, utility room and ground floor WC and storeroom, re-planning and replacement of the kitchen,
- alterations to the layout of the first-floor master bedroom ensuite and walk-in-wardrobe
- new staircase to attic floor
- replacement of the fireplace to the lounge
- replacement of the fires to the master bedroom, re-instatement of original surround and new fire to bedroom 3
- installation of a shower room to attic floor
- conversion of remaining areas of the attic
- a new lighting scheme throughout the property

The alterations to the layout of the ground floor and the first floor master bedroom will not have an impact on the significance of the listed building, the walls to be altered are modern partition walls reflecting more recent changes to the layout of the building.

The new staircase to the attic will replace an existing modern staircase that is not compliant with the building regulations. There is a sufficient void to accommodate the new staircase with minimal loss of floor structure in the attic. These works will cause minimal harm.

The ground floor fireplace to be replaced dates from the 20th century. Its loss will cause no harm. There is a good surround painted white in bedroom 2 with a bolection moulding that may date from the 18th century, it has a cast iron insert, this will be retained. A matching surround is in bedroom 3, an insert matching that in bedroom 3 has been found in the attic and will be put back. The master bedroom has no fireplace at present. The works to the fireplaces will be a slight enhancement.

The proposed structural design of the new attic floor construction would involve installing new steel channels to each side of the existing truss ceiling tie member, which in turn would span between new beams installed to span in a left to right direction between load bearing walls, as shown on drawing 20_031_SK102 P3. Timber joists would span between the new channels, and notch into the web of the channel to provide a new floor construction within the depth of the existing truss ceiling tie zone. The new floor structure would be completely independent of the existing roof and ceiling structure and could, if required, be removed at a future date to leave existing historic structure largely unaffected by the proposed alterations. Partition walls would be added to west end of the attic floor to form a new shower room, the waste would connect via a short addition into an existing soil pipe.

The attic conversion will require significant structural additions but will not result in the loss of any historic fabric. It will therefore have a minimal impact on the significance of the listed building.

The installation of the new lighting scheme internally will not have any impact on the significance of the listed building.

Justification

Paragraph 194 of the NPPF requires that the Local Planning Authority should require clear and convincing justification for any harm.

The works requiring justification are the replacement of the windows, the installation of rooflights, the replacement of the staircase and the conversion of the attic.

Some of the existing windows are rotten and leaking, with some having undergone crude attempts at repair and alteration in the past. Others will not open or are a security risk. None of the windows affected by the proposals are the original and unaltered windows for the date of the window opening and therefore of high architectural interest. The large attic space is presently lit by a single dormer and windows at the gable end. It is large space that cannot be brought into use without additional daylight and ventilation. Conversion of the attic allows for more useable space to be created without the need for an extension, which would result in greater harm to the architectural and historic interest of the listed building. The staircase is non-compliant with building regulations, its replacement will result in minimal loss of historic fabric. This is considered sufficient justification for the level of harm caused.

Weighing of harm against public benefits

Paragraph 196 of the NPPF requires that where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use.

The applicant has commissioned historic building recording, which has advanced understanding of the building's significance. Extensive repairs are proposed that will secure its long-term future. One historic fireplace will be reinstated. These are all public heritage benefits. The energy performance of the building will be improved by replacing existing single glazed windows, this is a public benefit due to the reduction of carbon emissions. These benefits together are considered to outweigh the moderate level of harm caused by aspects of the proposed alterations.

Conclusion

The NPPF has introduced a presumption in favour of sustainable development. The policies set out in the NPPF taken as a whole constitute the Government's view of what sustainable development means in practice.

This application has been assessed against relevant policies in the development plan and other material considerations. It is considered that the

development would constitute sustainable development and is therefore recommended for approval.

Recommendation – GRANT CONSENT

Decision Authorisation - Delegated Powers

Application Number: 2020/93387

Officer Recommendation: GRANT CONSENT

Conditions and Reasons

1. The development shall be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date on which consent is granted.

Reason: Pursuant to Section 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, as amended by the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in complete accordance with the plans and specifications schedule listed in this decision notice except as may be specified in the conditions attached to this permission, which shall in all cases take precedence.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt as to what is being permitted and so as to ensure the satisfactory appearance of the development on completion, in the interests of the significance of the heritage asset and to accord within the National Planning Policy Framework.

3. Replacement stone roofing slates shall be locally quarried or reclaimed from local sources and match the existing in respect of unit dimensions, colour and texture.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt as to what is being permitted and so as to ensure the satisfactory appearance of the development on completion, in the interests of the significance of the heritage asset and to accord within the National Planning Policy Framework.

4. Replacement walling stone shall be locally quarried or reclaimed from local sources and match the existing in respect of unit dimensions, colour and texture.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt as to what is being permitted and so as to ensure the satisfactory appearance of the development on completion, in the interests of the significance of the heritage asset and to accord within the National Planning Policy Framework.

5. Before repointing work begins, details of the lime mortar mix, profile and finish shall be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt as to what is being permitted and so as to ensure the satisfactory appearance of the development on completion, in the interests of the significance of the heritage asset and to accord within the National Planning Policy Framework.

Plans and specifications schedule:-

Plan Type	Reference	Version	Date Received
-----------	-----------	---------	---------------

Plan Type	Reference	Version	Date Received
Design & Access Statement	Job nr. 19051		08/10/20
General Arrangement as Existing	19051D-01-P01		08/10/20
Elevations as existing	19051D-02-P01		08/10/20
Window Details	19051D-04-P03		23/12/20
General Arrangement as Proposed and Location Plan	19051D-05-P06		08/10/20
Elevations as proposed	19051D-06-P03		08/10/20
Sections and details as proposed	19051D-07-P04		08/10/20
Window schedule - as proposed	19051Sc-02-P02		08/10/20
Historic Building Analysis Report			08/10/20
Historic Building Analysis Drawings			08/10/20
Low House High Flatts Structural Engineers Report	20_031 SR_01		08/10/20
Structural Design Statement	20_031_DS_01		08/10/20
Structural Survey Notes	20_031_SK001 P1		08/10/20
Structural Survey Notes	20_031_SK002 P1		08/10/20
Structural Survey Notes	20_031_SK003 P1		08/10/20
Structural Survey Notes	20_031_SK004 P1		08/10/20
Structural Survey Notes	20_031_SK005 P1		08/10/20
Structural Survey Notes	20_031_SK006 P1		08/10/20
Structural Survey Notes	20_031_SK007 P1		08/10/20
Schedule for Intrusive Investigation Roof Void Plan	20_031_SK008 P1		08/10/20
Schedule for Intrusive Investigation First Floor Plan	20_031_SK009 P1		08/10/20
Schedule for Intrusive Investigation Ground Floor Plan	20_031_SK010 P1		08/10/20
Conversion of Attic Space Plan	20_031_SK102 P3		08/10/20
Conversion of Attic Space Section DD EE FF	20_031_SK103_1 P2		08/10/20
Schematic detail of remedial repair to ashlar stone to rear elevation bay windows	20_031_SK104 P1-		08/10/20

Pursuant to article 35 (2) of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) Order 2015 and guidance in the National Planning Policy Framework, the Local Authority have, where possible, made a pre-application advice service available, complied with the Kirklees Development Management Charter 2015 and otherwise actively engaged with the applicant in dealing with the application. Revision to the window details were negotiated and clarifications were provided on the structural repairs and the significance of the store door and doorway.

Report Dated: 08/01/2021

