Consultation Response from KC Conservation and Design		
2019/90346 8, Hungerford Road, Edgerton, Huddersfield, HD3 3AL		
Demolition of existing dwelling and erection of detached dwelling (within a Conservation Area)		
Date Responded: 28/02/19	Responding Officer: Craig McHugh	Responding Ref: Edgerton

Summary

The proposed development affects the Edgerton Conservation Area and the setting of Somerville, No.4 Hungerford Road, which is grade II listed. The demolition of No.8 Hungerford Road is supported. Further information is required on the impact of the proposed new dwelling on the setting of Somerville and revised proposals are required that better respond to its setting (layout and scale) and the character and appearance of the conservation area (architectural details and materials). Conservation and Design have concerns about the proposed development on heritage and design grounds, particularly with regards to Local Plan Policy PLP 24 and paragraphs 189, 190 and 200 of the NPPF. Historic England should be notified of the proposal.

Significance of the heritage assets affected

The proposed development affects the Edgerton Conservation Area and the setting of Somerville, No.4 Hungerford Road, which is grade II listed.

The Edgerton Conservation Area

We have adopted a Conservation Area Appraisal which identifies a number of distinct character areas, Hungerford Road lies within Area 1. The high architectural quality of the buildings within the area is reflected in number of buildings that are listed as being of historic or architectural significance. In view of the fact that the majority of the buildings were built at a similar period, during the mid-late nineteenth century, the historic buildings reflect the styles favoured by the Victorian builders, and are generally based on either Medieval, Tudor and Jacobean English houses or Classical and Renaissance architectural from continental Europe, particularly Italy.

Historically, the area is characterised by low density development later infill has resulted in a closer urban grain. No. 8 Hungerford dates from c.1955-65, it is identified in the appraisal as a negative factor.

Somerville No.4 Hungerford Road

A mid-19th century villa of a grand scale with elaborate detailing in an Italianate style set in a relatively spacious plot. Its setting is formed by Oakwood House (No.2 Hungerford Road) to the east, the grounds of Cote Royd (No.7 Halifax Road) to the north, No.8 Hungerford Road to the west and Hungerford Road to the south. No.8 detracts from its setting by virtue of its poor design quality and materials and close proximity to its property boundary. An access road for an electricity substation separates the boundaries of No.4 and No.8.

Impact of the proposals on significance

The principle of demolishing the existing No.8 Hungerford Road is supported, as the present building detracts from the significance of the conservation area and the setting of Somerville.

The proposed dwelling would be built up against the eastern edge of the plot of No.8, as is the existing, with its lowest element, the garage against the boundary. The proposed dwelling's height is significantly greater (9.25m to the ridge of the house, 6.25m to the ridge of the garage) than the existing (7.25 and 2.75 respectively). Consequently, the proposed dwelling would have a more harmful impact on the setting of Somerville than the existing. It may be possible to mitigate this impact by locating the garage further back from the front elevation.

The existing front elevation shows the height of No.10 to be 7.75m. The proposed elevation shows it as having a height of 8.2m. These discrepancies should be addressed. Site sections should be requested showing the proposed dwelling in context with Somerville and No.10 for the avoidance of doubt and to fully assess the impact of the proposed dwelling on the setting of Somerville.

The proposed replacement lacks a clear architectural style in contrast to properties that contribute to the character of the conservation area it has an unconvincing mix of vernacular, classical and contemporary details. It is a broadly symmetrical two-and-a-half storey property with a two-storey porch and attached double garage. The Design Access and Heritage Statement suggests the proposed development is of a similar style to the new house adjacent to No.10 (presumably 7a Thornhill Road), which is a successful interpretation of the typical vernacular houses of the Jacobean period in West Yorkshire. These precedents were invariably asymmetric as they were designed around their internal layout in contrast to classically inspired properties were a symmetrical elevation took priority and the layout was contrived to fit. Two-storey porches are a vernacular detail, but they are not supported on pillars as is proposed. Classically designed houses feature one or more of the orders of classical architecture (e.g. Doric, Ionic, Tuscan or Corinthian), which are absent here and dormers align above the windows below.

The proposed material palette is stone walling, concrete tile roofing and brown UPVC doors and windows. Stone slate roofing, Welsh slate (as approved at 10 Hungerford Road and 7a Thornhill Road) or rosemary clay tiles (if appropriate to the style of the building) would be in keeping with the character of the conservation area. Timber windows and doors would also be more in keeping.

Relevant Policies/Guidance

Paragraph 189 of the NPPF requires that we should require an applicant to describe the significance of any heritage assets affected, including any contribution made by their setting. The level of detail should be proportionate to the assets' importance and no more than is sufficient to understand the potential impact of the proposal on their significance. As a minimum the relevant historic environment record should have been consulted and the heritage assets assessed using appropriate expertise where necessary.

The applicant has not made reference to consulting the HER or the Edgerton Conservation Area Appraisal, nor has it been identified that the proposal affects the setting of the adjacent listed building. Consequently the design of the proposed development fails to respond to these heritage assets. We should request a revised Heritage Statement and site sections showing the existing and proposed dwelling in context with Somerville and No.10 Hungerford Road.

We should avoid or minimise any conflict between the heritage asset's conservation and any aspect of the proposal (NPPF para.190) and seek proposals that promote good design that respects and enhances the character of the townscape and heritage assets (Local Plan Policy PLP 24 Design). We should request revised proposals that better respond to the setting of the adjacent listed building and the character and appearance of the conservation area.

We should look for opportunities for new development within Conservation Areas and within the setting of heritage assets, to enhance or better reveal their significance (NPPF para.200). The current

proposal would not enhance the conservation area and would be harmful to the setting of the adjacent listed building.

Conclusion

Conservation and Design have concern about the proposed development on heritage and design grounds, particularly with regards to Local Plan Policy PLP 24 and paragraphs 189, 190 and 200 of the NPPF.

Recommendations

We should notify Historic England of the proposal as it affects the character or appearance of a Conservation Area and involves the erection of a new building or the extension of an existing building where the area of land in respect of which the application is made is more than 1,000 square metres.

We should seek a revised Heritage Statement and site sections showing the existing and proposed dwelling in context with Somerville and No.10 Hungerford Road.

We should seek revised proposals focusing on the layout and scale of the proposed development in relation to Somerville and architectural detailing and materials more in keeping with the character and appearance of the conservation area.