
From: Nigel Hunston
Sent: 21 September 2016 11:23
To: Farzana Tabasum
Subject: 2016/92812 at location Victoria Works, Fisher Green, Honley, Holmfirth, HD9 6DP

The application looks towards the demolition of the existing mill buildings and their replacement with 17 apartments.

In terms of the demolition of the buildings whilst they are a representation of the former textile industry they have been altered and lost much of their significance. They do however offer some enclosure to the street scene and context in terms of scale and material. I do not object to the demolition. Turning to the redevelopment of the site, this offers great opportunities to improve the street scene, take on board the context of the area and provide a viable use for the site. Equally there is the opportunity to enhance the setting of West House, a grade 2 listed building opposite.

Layout

I feel this is a good response to the site and its constraints and turns the corner well using the topography of the site. However, I question the two small areas behind the boundary wall which due to their size and location will not be used and be nothing more than a litter trap. I do appreciate that this is a response to the topography of the site and the need to 'sit' the block low so as not to harm the setting of the listed building. The block does provide the sense of enclosure to both Meltham Road and Fisher Green which again is a plus for the development.

Elevational Treatment

NW elevation-I feel the stepped approach to the ridge line is a good one and is a way of using the topography of the site. However, there is quite a leap between the two main ridge lines with the stair tower rather accentuating it than reducing it. The block is set back rather than following the road line and I wonder if this step is removed with, to a degree, a flat fronted approach being the better option. I make reference to the render panels below and on this elevation I see no need for them; the use of a single walling material is the way forward here.

SW elevation-this elevation fronts on to Fisher Green and as such warrants a strong elevation that is well detailed and whilst providing interest does not deviate from the context of the area. I do not believe this has been achieved here. The gable projections are weak and fail to break up the elevation and when combined with the balconies the interest is lost. I do not see the reasoning behind the balconies, they do not enjoy views of any quality, they provide 'holes' into the elevation that weaken the approach and with the inclusion of the render panels they are at odds with the context of the area. I would suggest that these are removed from the scheme and the gables made wider, thus stronger, with a higher projection into the roof slope. This would also help the entrance doors which appear divorced from the elevation.

SE elevation-The windows on the main block are not in proportion which is made worse with the infill render panel. The traditional approach, which is one I would support here is windows being of equal width with any requirement for blanking being carried out by recessed stone. The width of gable leads to a certain feeling of 'blank space' which may be made more interesting with a different approach. Again I question the use of balconies but this is not as important on this elevation.

NE elevation-I have mentioned the use of render before and the ill proportioned end gable windows but apart from this this appears acceptable.

Materials

I welcome the use of natural stone which will help assimilate the development into the surrounding area. However, I do question the use of render to break up the elevations which to me does nothing to aid the design; I feel a simple

choice and a limited palette would do more than something that is not really part of the area. The use of such a material is particularly jarring to the eye on the panels between the windows on the south east elevation, which are not in proportion and accentuate horizontality which with a wide gable does little to promote a high standard of design.

Overall I feel there is more work to be done but the principle of such a development on this site is felt to be appropriate.

Nigel Hunston
Group Leader (Conservation and Design)
Investment and Regeneration Services
PO Box B93
Civic Centre 3
Huddersfield
HD1 2JR

Tel: 01484 221000
Internal: 860 2924
Short Code 04254
Lync code: 74217